

Higher Education Commission
National Computing Education Accreditation Council
(NCEAC)
Minutes of the 12th Meeting of National Computing Education
Accreditation Council

The 12th Meeting of the National Computing Education Accreditation Council (NCEAC) was held Saturday, April 09, 2011 at 12:00 noon. The venue of the meeting was Mural Hall, HEC Headquarters, H-9, and Islamabad. The meeting was chaired by Prof. Dr. Aftab Ahmad, Chairman, NCEAC.

The following members of the Council attended the Meeting:

1. Prof. Dr. Azam Ali Khawaja, MD, QAA, HEC, Islamabad
2. Prof. Dr. Syed Mansoor Sarwar, Principal PUCIT, Lahore
3. Prof. Dr. Ayub Alvi, Dean, FAST- NUCES, Islamabad
4. Prof. Dr. Imdad Ali Ismaili, Director IIT, University of Sindh, Jamshoro
5. Prof. Dr. Shoaib Ahmad Khan, EME College, NUST, Rawalpindi
6. Prof. Dr. M. Abid Khan, Professor, Dept. of CS, University of Peshawar
7. Prof. Dr. Zubair Shaikh, Professor, FAST- NUCES, Karachi
8. Mr. Syed Ali Abbas Hussani, Representative of PSEB, Islamabad
9. Mr. Muhammad Aslam Lashari, Pakistan Computer Bureau, Islamabad
10. Mr. Abdul Haleem Asghar, Representative of Ministry of Science and Technology, Islamabad
11. Mr. Rana Saud , Representative of Ministry of IT & Telecom, Islamabad
12. Mr. Abdul Waheed, , Representative of IT Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi
13. Mr. Israr Hussain, Secretary, IT Department, Govt. of Baluchistan, Quetta
14. Mr. Asim Khan, Representative IT Board, AJ&K, Muzaffarabad
15. Mr. Fida Hussain, DG, QAA, HEC, Islamabad

The following members could not attend the Meeting due to their preoccupation:

1. Dr. Muid Mufti, CEO, ID Technologies, Islamabad
2. Representative of Punjab IT Board, Govt. of Punjab, Lahore
3. Miss Jehan Ara, President, PASHA, Karachi
4. Representative of Directorate of IT, Peshawar

Prof. Dr. Aftab Ahmad, Chairman NCEAC welcomed and thanked the members for attending the meeting.

Agenda Item No. 1 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Eleventh Meeting of NCEAC

Minutes of the Eleventh Meeting of NCEAC held on Thursday, November 25, 2010 were previously submitted to all members and also furnished for the current Meeting. However, no comments were received so far. Accordingly, Prof. Dr. Imdad Ali proposed and seconded by Dr. Ayub Alivi for approval. The same were approved by the Council.

Resolution No. 12.1.04.11

Minutes of the Eleventh Meeting of NCEAC stand approved.

Agenda Item No. 2 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Sixth Meeting of Accreditation & Standards Committee

Minutes of the Sixth Meeting of ASC held on Thursday, November 25, 2010 were previously submitted to all members and also furnished for the current Meeting. However, no comments were received so far. Accordingly, Prof. Dr. Imdad Ali proposed and seconded by Dr. Ayub Alivi for approval. The same were approved by the Council.

Resolution No 12.2.04.11: Minutes of the Sixth Meeting of Accreditation and Standards Committee stand approved.

Agenda Item No. 3 Consideration of Approval of the Minutes of the Seventh Meeting of Accreditation and Standard Committee, National Computing Education Accreditation Council

Minutes of the Seventh Meeting of the Accreditation and Standards Committee held on Saturday, April 09, 2011 at 10: 00 am in Mural Hall, HEC, H-9, Islamabad were furnished to all the participants of the meeting. The said Minutes of the meeting were approved by the Council. A copy of the same is enclosed herewith as Annex-A.

Resolution No 12.3.04.11: Minutes of the Seventh Meeting of Accreditation and Standards Committee stand approved.

Agenda Item No. 4

a. Consideration of recommendations of Accreditation and Standards Committee regarding Accreditation Inspection Report of AIR University, Islamabad

The recommendations of Accreditation and Standard Committee regarding Accreditation Assessment Profile (Annex-A & Annex-B) of BS (Computer Science) program of AIR University, Islamabad were presented and discussed.

Resolution No 12.4.04.11.a: The Council decided to award **Accreditation Category Y (Batches of Academic Years 2007-2011)** to BS (Computer Science) program of AIR University, Islamabad as per the respective Accreditation Profile enclosed herewith as *Annex-PU/AIR-Ibd/10*

b. Consideration of recommendations of Accreditation and Standards Committee regarding Accreditation Inspection Report of QURTUBA University, D. I. Khan

The recommendations of Accreditation and Standard Committee regarding Accreditation Assessment Profile (Annex-A & Annex-B) of BCS program of QURTUBA University, D. I. Khan were presented and discussed.

Resolution No 12.4.04.11.b: The Council decided to award **Accreditation Category Y (Batches of Academic Years 2007-2011)** to BCS program of QURTUBA University, D. I. Khan as per the

respective Accreditation Profile enclosed herewith as *Annex-PR/ QURTUBA /11*

c. Consideration of the Accreditation Assessment Profile for the Recommendation of Accreditation Category/Rating regarding Dept. of Computer Science, University of Peshawar

The recommendations of Accreditation and Standard Committee regarding Accreditation Assessment Profile (Annex-A & Annex-B) of BCS program of Dept. of Computer Science, University of Peshawar were presented and discussed.

Resolution No 12.4.04.11.c: The Council decided to award **Accreditation Category X (Batches of Academic Years 2007-2011 and 2008-2012)** to BCS program of Dept. of Computer Science, University of Peshawar as per the respective Accreditation Profile enclosed herewith as *Annex-PU/ UoP /11*

d. Consideration of the Accreditation Assessment Profile for the Recommendation of Accreditation Category/Rating regarding SAZBIST, Karachi Campus

The recommendations of Accreditation and Standard Committee regarding Accreditation Assessment Profile (Annex-A & Annex-B) of BS (Computing) program of SAZBIST Karachi Campus were presented and discussed.

The decision regarding award of accreditation category/rating was deferred due to the following important observations concerning the application and inspection of accreditation:

1. The application was made for three programs given by BS-CS, BS-SE and BS-IT. However, AIR is based on a new BS-Computing program only
2. It seems that all the said three programs have been merged into one program of BS-Computing. It certainly raises pertinent questions that how students admitted in three different programs are being treated in one program. How interest of the students has been protected?
3. What is curriculum of BS-Computing program? Currently, NCEAC has no program with nomenclature of BS-Computing for accreditation.

The reply concerning the above-mentioned observations is to be sought from the respective institutions and AIC. The matter will be placed before the Council on the availability of the required information.

Resolution No 12.4.04.11.d: The Council deferred award of **Accreditation Category** to BS (Computing) program of SAZBIST, Karachi Campus.

Agenda Item No. 5 Action Report-Publication of ad regarding Public Alert in national newspapers

Action noted.

Agenda Item No. 6 Action Report-Compilation of data regarding nationwide computing programs

A substantial effort was made by the Secretariat of the Council to compile information concerning the following parameters of the computing degree programs offered both by **public and private sector institutions** in all seven regions (**Federal Area, Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Baluchistan, Gilgit & Northern Areas and AJK**) of the country.

1. Regional and nationwide BS Computing degree Programs Offered [CS, SE, IT, BI, IS]
2. Regional and nationwide MS/MPhil Computing degree Programs Offered [CS, SE, IT, BI, IS]
3. Regional and nationwide PhD Computing degree Programs Offered [CS, SE, IT, BI, IS]
4. Summary of all computing degree programs offered

The effort by the Secretariat of the Council regarding compilation and presentation of the data was appreciated and it was suggested collection of currently region based enrollment data in computing programs nationwide may also be sought from QAA, HEC for record and reference.

The Chairman pointed out it has been planned that the data concerning IT companies in Pakistan will be collected as well for information of students and graduates of computing.

Agenda Item No.7 Action Report-Summary of accredited programs and applications Received

Summary of accredited programs and applications Received was presented and discussed. The same is sent herewith for the record and information of the members of the Council.

Agenda Item No.8 Action Report- Minutes of the First Meeting of Four Accreditation Councils Established by HEC held on January 20, 2011

Action noted.

Agenda Item No.9 Rating of Performance of NCEAC by HEC

The Rating Performance card issued by HEC for all four accreditation councils was presented. NCEAC has been rated on the **highest position scoring 91/100 points**. It is evident that the NCEAC is well managed and progressing successfully.

Agenda Item No.10 Action Report-Training of Program Evaluators by Trainer from International Organization

Prof. Dr. Aftab Ahmad briefed regarding the following decision made in the First Meeting of Four Accreditation Councils Established by HEC held on January 20, 2011:

1. Proposal for holding workshops will be submitted by each Council within one month to QAA.

2. Resource Persons for holding the workshops will be identified by the respective Councils. They should preferably be internationally acclaimed experts.
3. Names of Evaluators selected will be communicated to QAA within one month by the Councils. Regional representation will be given due consideration during selection process.

Moreover, it was also briefed the following actions taken in this regard:

1. ABET was contacted for hiring of the required trainer. The same has been denied due to an exclusive notification concerning ban traveling to Pakistan by US State Department
2. Dr. Mudssar Wyne (Pak national), who is Commissioner at ABET offered to travel for the job in his private capacity. His email was forwarded to MD, QAA for his necessary action.
3. BCS (UK) was also contacted and regretted as well.
4. British Accreditation Council has shown their interest for the said training. However, a detailed response is awaited concerning detail of expenditures and schedule of workshop.

The following was suggested by the members for further action:

1. ABET maybe contacted for conduct of the said training program via video-conferencing.
2. Dr. Mudssar Wyne maybe hired by a university under special arrangement funded by HEC. The Chairman, NCEAC requested all members from universities for initiating the said proposal.

Agenda Item No.11 Development of Media Promotion/ Communication Strategies required by HEC

The following decision was made in the First Meeting of Four Accreditation Councils Established by HEC held on January 20, 2011:

1. A comprehensive communication strategy will be prepared by each council.
2. Advertisement to be placed in newspapers by the Councils will be routed through HEC so that the advertisement rates are reduced and become at par with those paid by HEC.
3. All four councils will make efforts to submit items related to their activities in the monthly HEC 'News and Views'

The Chairman, NCEAC solicited input from all members. Some useful directions were given by members. However, as formal full-fledged developed communication strategy is to be sent to HEC, accordingly, the following committee was constituted for the needful:

1. Prof. Dr. Imdad Ali Ismaili Convener

The committee was requested to submit the final report by the first week of May 2011. The same will be circulated among all members for approval and forwarded to HEC.

Resolution No. 12.11.04.11:

- a. Frequent publication of ads particularly during admission session
- b. Participation in Educational Exhibitions and publication of ad in the respective supplements
- c. Participation in the educational programs of electronic media
- d. Printing of brochures introducing NCEAC

Agenda Item No.12 Action Report- Audit Report of NCEAC

The Annual Audit Report of NCEAC for the year ended on September 30, 2010 by Ijaz Tabusum & Co was presented and discussed.

The members appreciated an excellent financial management of the Council by Prof. Dr. Aftab Ahmad, Chairman, NCEAC to minimize the expenditures. The administrative support of Foundation University Institute of Engineering and Management Sciences for the Council was also acknowledged.

Resolution No. 12.12.04.11: The Annual Audit Report of NCEAC for the year ended on September 30, 2010 by Ijaz Tabusum & Co stands approved.

Agenda Item No.13 Removal of Difficulties-Amendment of procedure regarding appointment of Convener of Accreditation Inspection Committee

The Chairman, NCEAC briefed the members regarding the following difficulties encountered to appoint the Convener of Accreditation Inspection Committees from the members of Council as per Clause (15)-Accreditation Visits (b) of approved Procedures:

1. It is evident from our previous experience that frequent availability of Member of Council is not feasible due to their official engagements.
2. Generally, preference in scheduling of inspections is given to the respective institutions to encourage them
3. It is expected that demand for accreditation inspections will grow in due course of time given the total number of computing degree programs offered in the country. Accordingly, the existing procedure will certainly hinder timely scheduling of inspections and objectives of the Council to make accreditation widespread and nationwide.

Reference: Clause (15) - Accreditation Visits (b)

The Chairperson of the Council shall head Accreditation Inspection Committee or a Member of Council as nominated by the Chairperson

The following amendment was proposed:

The Chairperson of the Council may nominate Convener of the Accreditation Inspection Committee (AIC) from Council or list of the approved Program Evaluators of the Council subject to the condition that he/she has participated in atleast three inspection visits

The matter was also placed before ASC and same was recommended for approval as per Minutes of the Seventh Meeting of ASC (Enclosed as Annex-A).

Resolution No. 12.13.04.11: The Clause (15) - Accreditation Visits (b) of the approved procedures shall now read as:

“The Chairperson of the Council may nominate Convener of the Accreditation Inspection Committee (AIC) from Council or list of the approved Program Evaluators of the Council subject to the condition that he/she has participated in atleast three inspection visits”

Agenda Item No.14 Action Report-Special Meeting with ED, HEC & Proposal for organization of Regional Meetings

1. AS approved by the Council, a special meeting was held by the Chairman, NCEAC with the ED, HEC on December 31, 2010 to discuss the current status of accreditation of computing programs by NCEAC and relevant issues. In particular, it was emphasized that response of public and private sector institutions needs to be improved. To this end role of HEC is instrumental and support from ED, HEC was solicited.
2. It was agreed that the second round of regional meetings of representatives of public and private sector institutions is to be planned and organized. Accordingly, the following plan is proposed for the regional meetings for implementation and coordination by HEC (QAA Division) :

Tentative Schedule

Sr#	Region	Tentative Date	Venue
1	Federal Area, Rawalpindi, Wah, Attock, Jehlum, Hazra, Mirpur and Muzffarabad	Last week of April 2011	HEC, Islamabad
2	KPK, Northern Area and Gilgit	Last week of May 2011	HEC, Peshawar
3	Punjab (Except areas mentioned in Sr#1)	Last week of June 2011	HEC, Lahore
4	Sindh and Balochistan	Last week of July 2011	HEC, Karachi

Resolution No. 12.14.04.11: The proposed tentative schedule is approved for organization of the regional meetings. MD, QAA is requested for implementation.

Agenda Item No.15 Any new matter with permission of the Chair

a. Nomenclature and Eligibility Criteria for BS (SE) program

A letter from the Deputy Registrar, APCOM inquiring nomenclature and eligibility criteria (percentage of marks) was presented and discussed.

The following was resolved:

- i. It is recommended that nomenclatures adopted by NCEAC for BS programs are to be used as given by BS (CS), BS (SE), BS (IT), BS (IS) and BS (IT)
- ii. The eligibility criteria recommended in the curriculum report of the respective program is to be referred. The issue of requirement of percentage of marks in FA/Fsc for admission in BS program was discussed. It was resolved that the requirement given by HEC/HEC recognized university will be acceptable by NCEAC

b. Registration of Faculty Members

It was resolved that the registration system for faculty members teaching in computing degree programs is to be introduced and ongoing database is to be maintained. The same will also support verification of faculty hired by the institutions during the inspection process. The matter is to be referred to the Registration Committee headed by Prof. Dr. M. A. Maud, UET, Lahore.

c. Revision of Processes & Procedures of Accreditation

The following two suggestions were given to be analyzed for possible revision:

i. Quantification of Criteria Satisfaction Verification (CSF)

It was suggested by members to investigate quantification of parameters of CSF to enhance objectivity in the process of allocating accreditation category/rating to the computing programs.

ii. Requirement of Minimum Length of Service of Faculty Members

It was suggested by members that criterion concerning evaluation of available faculty members maybe revised to ensure certain minimum service of teaching in the program.

Both matters are referred to the Process Revision Committee headed by Prof. Dr. Mansoor Sarwar for consideration.

d. Compilation of Data on IT Companies in Pakistan and Placement of Graduates

Prof. Dr. Aftab Ahmad proposed that it is crucial to collect data on IT companies in Pakistan and number of graduates placed. The said information will be certainly instrumental in devising future plan on computing education in Pakistan.

It was resolved that cooperation from PASHA and PSEB maybe solicited for the needful. Chairman, NCEAC may take an appropriate action in this regard.

The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.